Living with breathlessness: a systematic literature review and qualitative synthesis

Ann Hutchinson, Natalie Barclay-Klingle, Kathleen Galvin, Miriam J Johnson

Affiliations: AH, NBK and MJ University of Hull

KG University of Brighton

Corresponding author

Ann Hutchinson

3rd Floor Allam Medical Building HYMS University of Hull Cottingham Rd HULL HU6 7RX

hyah6@hyms.ac.uk

Take home message

Breathing Space: A conceptual framework for patients' coping, help-seeking and clinicians' response to breathlessness

Short title: Breathing Space: a qualitative synthesis

Online supplement

Widespread effects of breathlessness

The concept of "total dyspnea" (126) was used as a theoretical framework with which to analyse the data with respect to the widespread effects of breathlessness. It is important to realise that each of these realms affects the other, for example not being able to do physical activities can lead to changes in roles and social isolation can result in depression. Thus the concept of "total dyspnea" enables patients to be seen as complex, whole people in need of a holistic understanding of the many ways breathlessness affects their lives, on which effective management can be based.

Physical effects

Chronic breathlessness exacts a heavy physical toll, leading to curtailment of activities of daily living, disability, increased dependence on others and poor quality of life. Patients commented, across studies, that activities of daily living such as self-care and shopping are severely disrupted:

"The worst thing I think is the stairs, going up and down the stairs. Ordinary household chores I find difficult. Very restrictive, because of your breathing. And now of late... even simple things like having a shower and getting dressed." (Patient) (41)

"I can walk around 200 yards and then I have to sit down and rest even on a flat road.

You could walk round the shops, but you couldn't carry anything." (Patient) (88)

This reduced ability to carry out activities of daily living results in dependency on others which can be difficult to come to terms with:

"Being dependent on somebody used to make me upset in the beginning. Sometimes, although I was forcing myself to the limits not to ask for help, I was trying to manage my own work. But now, both me and people around me got accustomed to this disease." (Patient) (29)

Not only does breathlessness impose physical limitations on patients, but their carer's physical health can be affected by their role of carer. Individuals describe how their own health suffers:

"No time to worry about my physical health." "My health is not too good, I am physically worn out, anyhow I try not to think about it so much ... One has to work put food on the table and take care of the home as well." (Carer) (35)

Psychological effects

Breathlessness is closely interrelated with anxiety and panic, often leaving patients and carers feeling very vulnerable:

"Then I'd be fine but I am all the time worried—worried when this breathing will attack me again" (Patient) (97)

Not only do patients feel anxiety due to breathlessness but so do those that care for them:

"It ain't just me; it's my family as well. I've got two boys and my wife and they have to go through it as well, people tend to forget them . . . they just think about the person whose got the illness, not the people they've got around them and it does affect them big time, they get emotional, they're frightened." (Carer) (70)

Breathlessness can also lead to depression as a result of the physical limitations experienced and the subsequent losses felt. Inability to be as active as they had previously been leads many patients to feel depression:

"Depression is the biggest problem. It is the worst, because if you were an active person all your life and now you're inactive, it's hard to accept." (Patient) (117)

The strain of looking after someone who is depressed can exact a toll on those who care for them and lead them to feel depression too:

"He wouldn't have it that there was anything wrong with him. But that's just a thing, but between us we're we're alright, it just a strain, a constant strain of trying to keep him (...) not happy, but trying to keep him thinking positively and just trying to get through each day and some days it's not too bad and other days it's a real struggle ... he's becoming more and more depressed." (Carer) (33)

"I had become so depressed just after Christmas that I used to sit down at night, just crying ... I went to my GP and he gave me some pills and I think they have helped me a bit ... I have at least stopped crying. Still I am awfully tired mentally, and sad, terribly sad, mentally I am worn out." (Carer) (35)

Understanding the psychological difficulties that are faced by breathless patients and their carers is the key to help them manage breathlessness; unfortunately not everyone feels they get the understanding they deserve:

"The emotional thing is extremely, extremely important. You don't get the understanding ... you can just like get caught up in a downward spiral and you end up in this little place all by yourself ..." (Patient) (43)

Social effects

As previously described chronic breathlessness affects both patients and their carers significantly physically and psychologically, this in turn brings about various social consequences for them; including social isolation, changes to relationships and altered social roles.

Living with breathlessness on a daily basis results in developing ways of dealing with its impact and commonly patients describe how this culminates in changes in their lifestyle, often including some self-imposed limitations:

"I used to love dancing, I can't you know, and going anywhere where there's music now, no, because I want to get up and I can't and it upsets us." (Patient) (27)

As a consequence many become isolated and live with a constant sense of loss over all the activities they feel they are no longer able to do:

"My husband would say: 'Shall we go down and see John and Juliana?' and the thought of walking out that gate into the car, I would be absolutely gasping, I made excuses not to go out and this is what happens, the more you're housebound, the more depressed you get." (Patient) (66)

"We often feel lonely and on the edge of things." (Patient) (63)

This isolation results in psychological distress and changes in relationships with others for both the patient and their carer:

"Gradually we have had less and less to talk about ... gives the impression that he has no interest anymore, neither in myself nor in his surroundings. I think this is some kind of envy of me, in my heart I can feel it ... After he started to go in and out of hospitals we stopped being good friends like we used to be ... The disease has isolated him from the family and myself, and now we have restricted issues to talk about ... it makes me sad when I think about it." (Carer) (35)

Also intimate relationships can be affected by breathlessness, however these issues may go untackled:

"I am really in need of some form of intimate contact with him, but I do not want do press him ... and this is something one cannot talk so easily about ... I am afraid he could sense it as an accusation." (Carer) (35)

Both patient and carer may feel that their roles change when living with breathlessness. The physical effects of breathlessness mean that lifting and movement are constrained and activities like cooking, cleaning, decorating, making love or carrying shopping may become very difficult. When breathless people feel unable to do the activities that they associate with their gender role they feel less of a man or a woman, which can be very distressing:

"It's the silly things . . . not being able to carry the shopping . . . I was brought up in the Victorian school . . . the man always carries the bags...." (Patient) (36)

"For people like Chris that you can't actually see any physically wrong with them. I don't know, it makes life that little bit more difficult when you go out coz people look at you, like if I'm carrying the shopping bags and he's walking, doesn't bother me in the least, but people look and then it makes him feel awkward." (Carer) (65)

"He feels angry about the way breathing limits his life, he has been active all his life and now he can't do anything about it. He further describes problems with maintaining an active sex life and is deeply concerned about it. His cancer and his breathing are affecting all parts of him not just his lungs; his breathing has been bad enough but this (impotence), he feels not a complete man anymore...." (Carer) (89)

Carers also undergo changes in their roles, often moving away from having an intimate relationship (e.g. spouse) to having to take on many new roles and may lead to giving up work:

"It's a hard time I tell you and it gets you down. When you think what the nurses do in hospital, giving him his tablets and everything. I'm doing a thousand jobs as well. I'm just going crazy because you don't get to the end of it... We're nurses, we're doctors, we're housewives, we're cooks, we're gardeners." (Carer) (98)

This change in roles may lead to having to give up work and can adversely affect the relationship leading the carer to re-evaluate aspects of their life:

"Over the last 8–9 years, I feel inside that my role's completely changed. Somewhere in all of this, I've lost who I am. I'm more like his nurse or 'I need you' kind of thing. That's it – I need you, and I don't know how to explain it. I just feel like somewhere me, myself, I'm lost. I don't know who I am any more. I don't know if anybody can understand that." (Carer) (101)

Existential effects

There are many existential concerns associated with chronic breathlessness including inability to carry out religious observance, difficulty determining how best to use their remaining life, the daily struggle sometimes resulting in a lack of will to live and also the fear associated with the imagined manner of death.

Living with the burden of chronic breathlessness can mean that people are unable to continue on with their chosen religious observance at the very time they feel most in need of that support:

"I went down to Mass then in the car and my wife said to me 'You shouldn't go down because you're not able to walk all that far' and I really couldn't walk from the car park—I attempted and failed— it is only maybe about 200 yards—and I'd only gone a few yards and I said 'Look I can't—you're right I can't go any further—I'll have to stop'—so I had to come back and get into the car and go home." (Patient) (97)

Patients' difficulties in determining how best to use their remaining lifetime arise from a number of issues, involving both diagnosis and prognosis with respect to their underlying condition. Patients find that there was a lack of information with respect to their diagnosis and that often it meant little to them:

"We were just told that it was COPD. I had never heard of it and in fact, I couldn't remember the sequence of letters for a long time." (Patient) (67)

Often the relief at not having cancer means that patients do not realise the severity of their condition, as this is not clearly described to them:

"I've been to the doctors and they've told me I've got COPD. 'What is it?' The doctor hasn't even explained what those four letters mean and the worst thing about it is it starts off with C, and first thing you think: 'Oh, have I got cancer?' But this is the thing that is wrong, it's [COPD] not a well-known disease, yet it's one of the greatest killers." (Patient) (67)

Little attention is paid to describing likely prognosis with patients being left in a limbo, feeling they had an uncertain future and living day by day without planning:

"Erm, you know, I can't really say [how I see the future] we'll just take each day as it comes." (Patient) (67)

The lack of meaning of the diagnosis and inattention to prognosis means that they are unable to determine how they wish to spend the time left to them:

"At the time we weren't really told that was a degenerative condition that it would gradually get worse. At the beginning we weren't told that it was a general decline. We were just told this is what you've got, get on with it. Yes, in the beginning I would have liked a little bit more information. At least it prepares you for the general decline in his health." (Patient) (67)

Many people feel doubts over whether their life is worth living and express the desire to end their lives in order "to end the struggle to breathe" (Patient) (34):

"When the shortness of breath was at its extreme, I thought I was going to die and saw a coffin beside me and then I was in a tunnel... I did have thoughts about suicide and I envied the dead." (Patient) (89)

Also fear of the manner of their death can be a concern, with many patients unaware of both how their underlying condition may bring about their death and also how it could be medically managed by appropriate palliative care. With this lack of knowledge many patients (and also carers) believe that they may die with the feeling of suffocation that is regularly experienced with increased breathlessness and fear this greatly:

"I've always said I'm not afraid of dying 'cause I know where I'm going. But when I get short of breath I get scared – I don't know why – I shouldn't. I think smothering to death is a hard way to go." (Patient) (120)

"My worst fear is of slowly suffocating, dying gasping for breath when I'm alone here in my flat on me own, that's my worst fear." (Patient) (113)

"I have this constant fear that he will stop breathing, so I need to sleep near him so I can be on the alert if something happens." (Carer) (33)

When these issues are not discussed and planned for then the manner of death may indeed be very distressful for all concerned as described by the husband of a patient who died from lung cancer:

"...drown in her secretions sitting upright looking into my eyes crying for help. It was a nightmare and now I can't get those pictures out of my head, I know I did my best but I failed her-it was exactly what we didn't want, my life is in complete tatters." (Carer) (89)

References

- 1. Edmonds P, Karlsen S, Khan S, Addington-Hall J. A comparison of the palliative care needs of patients dying from chronic respiratory diseases and lung cancer. Palliative Medicine. 2001;15(4):287-95.
- 2. Muers M, Round C. Palliation of symptoms in non-small cell lung cancer: a study by the Yorkshire Regional Cancer Organisation Thoracic Group. Thorax. 1993;48(4):339-43.
- 3. Solano JP, Gomes B, Higginson IJ. A comparison of symptom prevalence in far advanced cancer, AIDS, heart disease, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease and renal disease. Journal of pain and symptom management. 2006;31(1):58-69.
- 4. Vos T, Allen C, Arora M, Barber RM, Bhutta ZA, Brown A, et al. Global, regional, and national incidence, prevalence, and years lived with disability for 310 diseases and injuries, 1990-2015: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2015. The Lancet. 2016;388(10053):1545-602.
- 5. Disler RT, Green A, Luckett T, Newton PJ, Currow D, Davidson PM. Experience of Advanced Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease: Metasynthesis of Qualitative Research. Journal of pain and symptom management. 2014.
- 6. Yu DS, Lee DT, Kwong AN, Thompson DR, Woo J. Living with chronic heart failure: a review of qualitative studies of older people. Journal of advanced nursing. 2008;61(5):474-83.
- 7. Gardiner C, Gott M, Payne S, Small N, Barnes S, Halpin D, et al. Exploring the care needs of patients with advanced COPD: an overview of the literature. Respiratory medicine. 2010;104(2):159-65.
- 8. Gysels M, Bausewein C, Higginson IJ. Experiences of breathlessness: a systematic review of the qualitative literature. Palliative & supportive care. 2007;5(03):281-302.
- 9. Falk H, Ekman I, Anderson R, Fu M, Granger B. Older patients' experiences of heart failure—an integrative literature review. Journal of Nursing Scholarship. 2013;45(3):247-55.
- 10. Giacomini M, DeJean D, Simeonov D, Smith A. Experiences of living and dying with COPD: a systematic review and synthesis of the qualitative empirical literature. Ontario health technology assessment series. 2012;12(13):1.
- 11. Harrison SL, Apps L, Singh S, Steiner MC, Morgan MD, Robertson N. "Consumed by breathing"-A critical interpretive meta-synthesis of the qualitative literature. Chronic illness. 2013:1742395313493122.
- 12. Johnson M, Yorke J, Hansen-Flaschen J. Towards an expert consensus to delineate a clinical syndrome of chronic breathlessness. Eur Respir J. 2017:13993003.02277-2016.
- 13. Gysels M, Higginson IJ. Access to services for patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: the invisibility of breathlessness. Journal of Pain & Symptom Management. 2008;36(5):451-60.
- 14. Flemming K. The synthesis of qualitative research and evidence-based nursing. Evidence Based Nursing. 2007;10(3):68-71.
- 15. Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DG. Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. Annals of internal medicine. 2009;151(4):264-9.
- 16. Flemming K, Briggs M. Electronic searching to locate qualitative research: evaluation of three strategies. Journal of Advanced Nursing. 2007;57(1):95-100.
- 17. Pearson A. Balancing the evidence: incorporating the synthesis of qualitative data into systematic reviews. JBI Reports. 2004;2(2):45-64.

- 18. Tong A, Flemming K, McInnes E, Oliver S, Craig J. Enhancing transparency in reporting the synthesis of qualitative research: ENTREQ. BMC medical research methodology. 2012;12(1):1.
- 19. Thomas J, Harden A. Methods for the thematic synthesis of qualitative research in systematic reviews. BMC medical research methodology. 2008;8(1):45.
- 20. Boyatzis RE. Transforming qualitative information: Thematic analysis and code development: Sage; 1998.
- 21. Barnett-Page E, Thomas J. Methods for the synthesis of qualitative research: a critical review. BMC medical research methodology. 2009;9(1):59.
- 22. Todres L, Galvin KT, Dahlberg K. "Caring for insiderness": Phenomenologically informed insights that can guide practice. International Journal of Qualitative Studies on Health and Well-being. 2014;9(1):21421.
- 23. Aasbø G, Solbrække KN, Kristvik E, Werner A. Between disruption and continuity: challenges in maintaining the 'biographical we'when caring for a partner with a severe, chronic illness. Sociology of health & illness. 2016;38(5):782-96.
- 24. Aasbø G, Rugkåsa J, Solbrække KN, Werner A. Negotiating the care-giving role: family members' experience during critical exacerbation of COPD in Norway. Health & social care in the community. 2017;25(2):612-20.
- 25. Adams R, Chavannes N, Jones K, Østergaard MS, Price D. Exacerbations of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease-A patients' perspective. Primary Care Respiratory Journal. 2006;15(2):102-9.
- 26. Ahmadi NS, Månsson J, Lindblad U, Hildingh C. Breathlessness in everyday life from a patient perspective: A qualitative study using diaries. Palliative & Supportive Care. 2014;12(3):189-94.
- 27. Apps LD, Harrison SL, Williams JEA, Hudson N, Steiner M, Morgan MD, et al. How do informal self-care strategies evolve among patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease managed in primary care? A qualitative study. International Journal of COPD. 2014;9:257-63.
- 28. Arnold E, Bruton A, Ellis-Hill C. Adherence to pulmonary rehabilitation: a qualitative study. Respiratory medicine. 2006;100(10):1716-23.
- 29. Avşar, Kaşikci. Living with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a qualitative study. Australian Journal of Advanced Nursing. 2010;28(2):46-52.
- 30. Bailey PH. Death stories: acute exacerbations of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Qualitative Health Research. 2001;11(3):322-38.
- 31. Bailey PH, Colella T, Mossey S. COPD-intuition or template: nurses' stories of acute exacerbations of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Journal of Clinical Nursing. 2004;13(6):756-64.
- 32. Bailey PH. The Dyspnea-Anxiety-Dyspnea Cycle--COPD Patients' Stories of Breathlessness: "It's Scary/When You Can't Breathe". Qualitative Health Research. 2004;14(6):760-78.
- 33. Bajwah S, Higginson IJ, Ross JR, Wells AU, Birring SS, Riley J, et al. The palliative care needs for fibrotic interstitial lung disease: A qualitative study of patients, informal caregivers and health professionals. Palliative Medicine. 2013;27(9):869-76.
- 34. Barnett M. Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a phenomenological study of patients' experiences. Journal of Clinical Nursing. 2005;14(7):805-12.
- 35. Bergs D. 'The Hidden Client'—women caring for husbands with COPD: their experience of quality of life. Journal of clinical nursing. 2002;11(5):613-21.

- 36. Booth, Silvester, Todd. Breathlessness in cancer and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: using a qualitative approach to describe the experience of patients and carers. Palliative & supportive care. 2003;1(4):337-44.
- 37. Booth S, Farquhar M, Gysels M, Bausewein C, Higginson I. The impact of a breathlessness intervention service (BIS) on the lives of patients with intractable dyspnea: a qualitative phase 1 study. Palliative & Supportive Care. 2006;4(3):287-93.
- 38. Bove DG, Zakrisson AB, Midtgaard J, Lomborg K, Overgaard D. Undefined and unpredictable responsibility: a focus group study of the experiences of informal caregiver spouses of patients with severe COPD. Journal of clinical nursing. 2016;25(3-4):483-93.
- 39. Boyle AH. Living with a spouse with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: the meaning of wives' experiences. Journal of Nursing and Healthcare of Chronic Illness. 2009;1(4):273-82.
- 40. Brandt CL. Study of Older Adults' Use of Self-Regulation for COPD Self-Management Informs An Evidence-Based Patient Teaching Plan. Rehabilitation Nursing. 2013;38(1):11-23.
- 41. Caress A, Luker K, Chalmers K. Promoting the health of people with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: patients' and carers' views. Journal of clinical nursing. 2010;19(3-4):564-73.
- 42. Chang YY, Dai YT, Chien NH, Chan HY. The Lived Experiences of People With Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease: A Phenomenological Study. Journal of Nursing Scholarship. 2016;48(5):466-71.
- 43. Cicutto L, Brooks D, Henderson K. Self-care issues from the perspective of individuals with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Patient education and counseling. 2004;55(2):168-76.
- 44. Clancy K, Hallet C, Caress A. The meaning of living with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Journal of Nursing and Healthcare of Chronic Illness. 2009;1(1):78-86.
- 45. Cooney A, Mee L, Casey D, Murphy K, Kirwan C, Burke E, et al. Life with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: striving for 'controlled co-existence'. Journal of Clinical Nursing. 2013;22(7/8):986-95.
- 46. Dickenson J. An exploratory study of patient interventions and nutritional advice for patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, living in the community. International Journal on Disability and Human Development. 2009;8(1):43-9.
- 47. Duck A, Spencer LG, Bailey S, Leonard C, Ormes J, Caress AL. Perceptions, experiences and needs of patients with idiopathic pulmonary fibrosis. Journal of advanced nursing. 2015;71(5):1055-65.
- 48. Dunger C, Higginson IJ, Gysels M, Booth S, Simon ST, Bausewein C. Breathlessness and crises in the context of advanced illness: a comparison between COPD and lung cancer patients. Palliative & supportive care. 2015;13(2):229-37.
- 49. Edmonds, Rogers A, Addington-Hall JM, McCoy A, Coats AJS, Gibbs JSR. Patient descriptions of breathlessness in heart failure. International Journal of Cardiology. 2005;98(1):61-6.
- 50. Ek K, Ternestedt BM. Living with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease at the end of life: a phenomenological study. Journal of Advanced Nursing. 2008;62(4):470-8.

- 51. Ek K, Sahlberg-Blom E, Andershed B, Ternestedt B-M. Struggling to retain living space: Patients' stories about living with advanced chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Journal of Advanced Nursing. 2011;67(7):1480-90.
- 52. Ek K, Ternestedt B-M, Andershed B, Sahlberg-Blom E. Shifting life rhythms: Couples' stories about living together when one spouse has advanced chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Journal of palliative care. 2011;27(3):189-97.
- 53. Elkington H, White P, Addington-Hall J, Higgs R, Pettinari C. The last year of life of COPD: a qualitative study of symptoms and services. Respiratory medicine. 2004;98(5):439-45.
- 54. Elofsson LC, Öhlén J. Meanings of being old and living with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Palliative Medicine. 2004;18(7):611-8.
- 55. Figueiredo D, Jácome C, Gabriel R, Marques A. Family care in chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: what happens when the carer is a man? Scandinavian journal of caring sciences. 2016;30(4):721-30.
- 56. Fotokian Z, Shahboulaghi FM, Fallahi-Khoshknab M, Pourhabib A. The empowerment of elderly patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: Managing life with the disease. PloS one. 2017;12(4):e0174028.
- 57. Fraser DD, Kee CC, Minick P. Living with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: Insiders' perspectives. Journal of Advanced Nursing. 2006;55(5):550-8.
- 58. Gabriel R, Figueiredo D, Jácome C, Cruz J, Marques A. Day-to-day living with severe chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: towards a family-based approach to the illness impacts. Psychology & Health. 2014;29(8):967-83.
- 59. Gardiner C, Gott M, Small N, Payne S, Seamark D, Barnes S, et al. Living with advanced chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: Patients concerns regarding death and dying. Palliative Medicine. 2009;23(8):691-7.
- 60. Genoe MR, Zimmer C. Breathing easier? The contradictory experience of leisure among people living with COPD. Activities, Adaptation & Aging. 2017:1-23.
- 61. Goldman R, Mennillo L, Stebbins P, Parker D. How do patients conceptualize chronic obstructive pulmonary disease? Chronic Respiratory Disease. 2016:1479972316680845.
- 62. Gott M, Gardiner C, Small N, Payne S, Seamark D, Barnes S, et al. Barriers to advance care planning in chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Palliative Medicine. 2009;23(7):642-8.
- 63. Guthrie S, Hill K, Muers M. Living with severe COPD. A qualitative exploration of the experience of patients in Leeds. Respiratory medicine. 2001;95(3):196-204.
- 64. Gysels, Higginson. Access to Services for Patients with Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease: The Invisibility of Breathlessness. Journal of Pain and Symptom Management. 2008;36(5):451-60.
- 65. Gysels, Higginson. Caring for a person in advanced illness and suffering from breathlessness at home: threats and resources. Palliative & Supportive Care. 2009;7(2):153-62.
- 66. Gysels, Higginson. Self-management for breathlessness in COPD: the role of pulmonary rehabilitation. Chronic respiratory disease. 2009;6(3):133-40.
- 67. Gysels, Higginson. The Experience of Breathlessness: The Social Course of Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease. Journal of Pain and Symptom Management. 2010;39(3):555-63.
- 68. Gysels, Higginson. The lived experience of breathlessness and its implications for care: A qualitative comparison in cancer, COPD, heart failure and MND. BMC Palliative Care. 2011;10(15).

- 69. Habraken JM, Pols J, Bindels PJ, Willems DL. The silence of patients with end-stage COPD: a qualitative study. British Journal of General Practice. 2008;58(557):844-9.
- 70. Hallas CN, Howard C, Theadom A, Wray J. Negative beliefs about breathlessness increases panic for patients with chronic respiratory disease. Psychology, Health & Medicine. 2012;17(4):467-77.
- 71. Harris D, Hayter M, Allender S. Improving the uptake of pulmonary rehabilitation in patients with COPD: Qualitative study of experiences and attitudes. British Journal of General Practice. 2008;58(555):703-10.
- 72. Hasson F, Spence A, Waldron M, Kernohan G, McLaughlin D, Watson B, et al. I can not get a breath: experiences of living with advanced chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. International journal of palliative nursing. 2008;14(11):526-31.
- 73. Henoch I, Bergman B, Danielson E. Dyspnea experience and management strategies in patients with lung cancer. Psycho-Oncology. 2008;17(7):709-15.
- 74. Jeng C, Tsao L-I, Ho C-H, Chang P-C. Experiences of daily activities within two weeks after hospital discharge among Taiwanese elderly patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Journal of Nursing Research. 2002;10(3):168-76.
- 75. Jones I, Kirby A, Ormiston P, Loomba Y, Chan KK, Rout J, et al. The needs of patients dying of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease in the community. Family Practice. 2004;21(3):310-3.
- 76. Kanervisto M, Kaistila T, Paavilainen E. Severe chronic obstructive pulmonary disease in a family's everyday life in Finland: perceptions of people with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease and their spouses. Nursing & health sciences. 2007;9(1):40-7.
- 77. Kerr A, Ballinger C. Living with chronic lung disease: An occupational perspective. Journal of Occupational Science. 2010;17(1):34-9.
- 78. Korpershoek YJ, Vervoort SC, Nijssen LI, Trappenburg JC, Schuurmans M. Factors influencing exacerbation-related self-management in patients with COPD: A qualitative study. International Journal of Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease. 2016;11(1):2977.
- 79. Lai YL, Chan CWH, Lopez V. Perceptions of dyspnea and helpful interventions during the advanced stage of lung cancer: Chinese patients' perspectives. Cancer Nursing. 2007;30(2):E1-E8.
- 80. Leidy NK, Haase JE. Functional status from the patient's perspective: the challenge of preserving personal integrity. Research in Nursing & health. 1999;22(1):67-77.
- 81. Lewis A, Bruton A, Donovan-Hall M. Uncertainty prior to pulmonary rehabilitation in primary care A phenomenological qualitative study in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Chronic respiratory disease. 2014;11(3):173-80.
- 82. Lowey SE, Norton SA, Quinn JR, Quill TE. Living with advanced heart failure or COPD: Experiences and goals of individuals nearing the end of life. Research in Nursing & Health. 2013;36(4):349-58.
- 83. Maguire R, Stoddart K, Flowers P, McPhelim J, Kearney N. An Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis of the lived experience of multiple concurrent symptoms in patients with lung cancer: A contribution to the study of symptom clusters. European Journal of Oncology Nursing. 2014;18(3):310-5.
- 84. Marx G, Nasse M, Stanze H, Boakye SO, Nauck F, Schneider N. Meaning of living with severe chronic obstructive lung disease: a qualitative study. BMJ open. 2016;6(12):e011555.

- 85. Mosher CE, Ott MA, Hanna N, Jalal SI, Champion VL. Coping with physical and psychological symptoms: a qualitative study of advanced lung cancer patients and their family caregivers. Supportive Care in Cancer. 2015;23(7):2053-60.
- 86. Nicholls DA. The experience of chronic breathlessness. Physiotherapy Theory and Practice. 2003;19(3):123-36.
- 87. Nicolson P, Andersen P. The patient's burden: Physical and psychological effects of acute exacerbations of chronic bronchitis. Journal of Antimicrobial Chemotherapy. 2000;45(TOPIC T2):25-32.
- 88. Nicolson P, Anderson P. Quality of life, distress and self-esteem: A focus group study of people with chronic bronchitis. British journal of health psychology. 2003;8(3):251-70.
- 89. O'Driscoll M, Corner J, Bailey C. The experience of breathlessness in lung cancer. European journal of cancer care. 1999;8(1):37-43.
- 90. Oliver SM. Living with failing lungs: the doctor–patient relationship. Family practice. 2001;18(4):430-9.
- 91. O'Neill ES. Illness representations and coping of women with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a pilot study. Heart & Lung: The Journal of Acute and Critical Care. 2002;31(4):295-302.
- 92. Overgaard D, Kaldan G, Marsaa K, Nielsen TL, Shaker SB, Egerod I. The lived experience with idiopathic pulmonary fibrosis: a qualitative study. European Respiratory Journal. 2016:ERJ-01566-2015.
- 93. Paap MC, Bode C, Lenferink LI, Groen LC, Terwee CB, Ahmed S, et al. Identifying key domains of health-related quality of life for patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: the patient perspective. Health and quality of life outcomes. 2014;12(1):106.
- 94. Pinnock H, Kendall M, Murray SA, Worth A, Levack P, Porter M, et al. Living and dying with severe chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: multi-perspective longitudinal qualitative study. Bmj. 2011;342.
- 95. Roberts DK, Thorne SE, Pearson C. The experience of dyspnea in late-stage cancer: patients' and nurses' perspectives. Cancer Nursing. 1993;16(4):310-20.
- 96. Robinson T. Living with severe hypoxic COPD: the patients' experience. Nursing times. 2005;101(7):38-42.
- 97. Ryan M, Farrelly M. Living with an unfixable heart: a qualitative study exploring the experience of living with advanced heart failure. European Journal of Cardiovascular Nursing. 2009;8(3):223-31.
- 98. Seamark DA, Blake SD, Seamark CJ, Halpin DMG. Living with severe chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD): Perceptions of patients and their carers. An interpretative phenomenological analysis. Palliative Medicine. 2004;18(7):619-25.
- 99. Shipman C, White S, Gysels M, White P. Access to care in advanced COPD: Factors that influence contact with general practice services. Primary Care Respiratory Journal. 2009;18(4):273-8.
- 100. Simon ST, Weingärtner V, Higginson IJ, Benalia H, Gysels M, Murtagh FE, et al. "I Can Breathe Again!" Patients' self-management strategies for episodic breathlessness in advanced disease, derived from qualitative interviews. Journal of pain and symptom management. 2016;52(2):228-34.
- 101. Simpson AC, Young J, Donahue M, Rocker G. A day at a time: caregiving on the edge in advanced COPD. International journal of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. 2010;5:141.

- 102. Small N, Gardiner C, Barnes S, Gott M, Halpin D, Payne S, et al. "You get old, you get breathless, and you die": Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease in Barnsley, UK. Health & Place. 2012;18(6):1396-403.
- 103. Spence A, Hasson F, Waldron M, Kernohan W, McLaughlin D, Watson B, et al. Professionals delivering palliative care to people with COPD: qualitative study. Palliative medicine. 2008.
- 104. Spence A, Hasson F, Waldron M, Kernohan G, McLaughlin D, Cochrane B, et al. Active carers: living with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. International journal of palliative nursing. 2008;14(8):368-72.
- 105. Strang S, Ekberg-Jansson A, Henoch I. Experience of anxiety among patients with severe COPD: A qualitative, in-depth interview study. Palliative & supportive care. 2014;12(6):465-72.
- 106. Stridsman C, Zingmark K, Lindberg A, Skär L. Creating a balance between breathing and viability: experiences of well-being when living with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Primary health care research & development. 2015;16(1):42-52.
- 107. Stull DE, Starling R, Haas G, Young JB. Becoming a patient with heart failure. Heart and Lung: Journal of Acute and Critical Care. 1999;28(4):284-92.
- 108. Taylor C, Hobbs F, Marshall T, Leyva-Leon F, Gale N. From breathless to failure: symptom onset and diagnostic meaning in patients with heart failure—a qualitative study. BMJ open. 2017;7(3):e013648.
- 109. Wainwright M. Sensing the Airs: The Cultural Context for Breathing and Breathlessness in Uruguay. Medical anthropology. 2017;36(4):332-47.
- 110. Walthall H, Jenkinson C, Boulton M. Living with breathlessness in chronic heart failure: a qualitative study. Journal of clinical nursing. 2017.
- 111. Walters JA, Hansen EC, Walters EH, Wood-Baker R. Under-diagnosis of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a qualitative study in primary care. Respiratory medicine. 2008;102(5):738-43.
- 112. Willgoss TG, Yohannes AM, Goldbart J, Fatoye F. "Everything was spiraling out of control": Experiences of anxiety in people with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Heart & Lung: The Journal of Acute and Critical Care. 2012;41(6):562-71.
- 113. Williams. Chronic respiratory illness: Psychology Press; 1993.
- 114. Williams, Bruton A, Ellis-Hill C, McPherson K. What really matters to patients living with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease? An exploratory study. Chronic respiratory disease. 2007;4(2):77-85.
- 115. Williams, Bruton A, Ellis-Hill C, McPherson K. The effect of pulmonary rehabilitation on perceptions of breathlessness and activity in COPD patients: a qualitative study. Prim Care Respir J. 2010;19(1):45-51.
- 116. Williams, Bruton A, Ellis-Hill C, McPherson K. The importance of movement for people living with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Qualitative health research. 2011;21(9):1239-48.
- 117. Wilson JS, O'Neill B, Reilly J, Macmahon J, Bradley JM. Education in Pulmonary Rehabilitation: The Patient's Perspective. Archives of Physical Medicine & Rehabilitation. 2007;88(12):1704-9.
- 118. Wong SS, Abdullah N, Abdullah A, Liew S-M, Ching S-M, Khoo E-M, et al. Unmet needs of patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD): a qualitative study on patients and doctors. BMC family practice. 2014;15(1):67.
- 119. Wood H, Connors S, Dogan S, Peel T. Individual experiences and impacts of a physiotherapist-led, non-pharmacological breathlessness programme for patients with intrathoracic malignancy: A qualitative study. Palliative Medicine. 2013;27(6):499-507.

- 120. Wortz K, Cade A, Menard JR, Lurie S, Lykens K, Bae S, et al. A qualitative study of patients' goals and expectations for self-management of COPD. Primary Care Respiratory Journal. 2012;21(4):384-91.
- 121. Young J, Donahue M, Farquhar M, Simpson C, Rocker G. Using opioids to treat dyspnea in advanced COPD: Attitudes and experiences of family physicians and respiratory therapists. Canadian Family Physician. 2012;58(7):e401-7.
- 122. Yu DSF, Lee DTF, Woo J. The revolving door syndrome: The Chinese COPD patients' perspectives. Journal of Clinical Nursing. 2007;16(9):1758-60.
- 123. Zakrisson A-B, Hagglund D. The asthma/COPD nurses experience of educating patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease in primary health care. Scandinavian Journal of Caring Sciences. 2010;24(1):147-55.
- 124. Hutchinson A. Patient and carer experience of breathlessness. Palliative Care in Respiratory Disease: ERS Monograph 73. 2016;73:102.
- 125. Farquhar M. Supporting informal carers. Palliative Care in Respiratory Disease (ERS Monograph) Sheffield, European Respiratory Society. 2016:51-69.
- 126. Abernethy, Wheeler. Total dyspnoea. Current Opinion in Supportive and Palliative Care. 2008;2(2):110-3.
- 127. Tobin DL, Holroyd KA, Reynolds RV, Wigal JK. The hierarchical factor structure of the Coping Strategies Inventory. Cognitive therapy and research. 1989;13(4):343-61.
- 128. Cornally N, McCarthy G. Help-seeking behaviour: A concept analysis. International journal of nursing practice. 2011;17(3):280-8.
- 129. Fricker M. Epistemic injustice: Power and the ethics of knowing: Oxford University Press Oxford; 2007.
- 130. Dictionary OE. Oxford English dictionary online. Mount Royal College Lib, Calgary. 2004;14.
- 131. Ammer C. The American heritage dictionary of idioms: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt; 2013.
- 132. Dictionary ME, Rundell M. Macmillan English Dictionary. Macmillan Education: 2007.
- 133. House R. The Random House dictionary of the English language. NY: Random House. 1987.
- 134. Alfred LT. Locksley Hall https://www.poetryfoundation.org/poems/45362/locksley-hall1842 [
- 135. Raphael D, Brown I, Renwick R, Cava M, Weir N, Heathcote K. Measuring the quality of life of older persons: a model with implications for community and public health nursing. International Journal of Nursing Studies. 1997;34(3):231-9.
- 136. Carel H. Illness: The cry of the flesh: Routledge; 2016. p13-16,19-29, 61-70.
- 137. Charmaz K. Good days, bad days: The self in chronic illness and time: Rutgers University Press; 1991.
- 138. Farquhar M, Penfold C, Benson J, Lovick R, Mahadeva R, Howson S, et al. Six key topics informal carers of patients with breathlessness in advanced disease want to learn about and why: MRC phase I study to inform an educational intervention. PloS one. 2017;12(5):e0177081.
- 139. Grant M, Cavanagh A, Yorke J. The impact of caring for those with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) on carers' psychological well-being: A narrative review. International Journal of Nursing Studies.49(11):1459-71.
- 140. Paterson BL. The shifting perspectives model of chronic illness. Journal of nursing scholarship. 2001;33(1):21-6.

- 141. Galvin KM, Todres L. Caring and Well-being: A Lifeworld Approach: Routledge; 2012.
- 142. Spathis A, Booth S, Moffat C, Hurst R, Ryan R, Chin C, et al. The Breathing, Thinking, Functioning clinical model: a proposal to facilitate evidence-based breathlessness management in chronic respiratory disease. Primary Care Respiratory Society UK. 2017.
- 143. Buckingham S, Kendall M, Ferguson S, MacNee W, Sheikh A, White P, et al. HELPing older people with very severe chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (HELP-COPD): mixed-method feasibility pilot randomised controlled trial of a novel intervention. NPJ primary care respiratory medicine. 2015;25:15020.
- 144. Hopkinson NS, Baxter N. Breathing SPACE—a practical approach to the breathless patient. npj Primary Care Respiratory Medicine. 2017;27(1):5.